

Meeting Hendon Area Environment Sub-committee

Date 13 March 2013

Subject Montagu Road Area - Parking and Traffic

**Investigations** 

Report of Director For Place

Summary The purpose of this report is to advise on the outcome of the

statutory consultation on proposals to introduce parking and traffic

improvement measures in the Montagu Road area.

Officer Contributors Karen Grinter

Status (public or exempt) Public

Wards affected West Hendon Ward

Enclosures Appendix A - Drawing Number 14817\_81a (Proposed Measures).

Appendix B - Drawing Number 14817 81b (Recommended

Measures).

Appendix C- List of recommended measures

For decision by Hendon Area Environment Sub-committee

Function of Executive

Reason for urgency / exemption from call-in

Not applicable

Contact for further information: Karen Grinter, Engineer, Design Team, Traffic and Development Section 020 8359 7908 karen.grinter@barnet.gov.uk

## 1.0 RECOMMENDATION

- 1.1 The Sub-committee note the details contained within this report and the conclusions drawn from the statutory consultation undertaken in the WH3 West Hendon Controlled Parking Zone (CPZ) for proposed traffic and parking improvement measures in the Montagu Road area.
- 1.2 The Sub-committee consider the following Officer recommendations:
  - That the measures outlined in this report as illustrated on Drawing No. 14817\_81b and detailed on Appendix C to this report are introduced on an experimental basis as soon as practicable, complying with all necessary statutory requirements through the making of the relevant Traffic Management Orders;
  - That the effectiveness and impact of the introduced measures be monitored closely and any necessary action identified to mitigate against ineffectiveness.
- 1.3 That subject to 1.2 above the Director for Place be instructed to introduce the measures and in due course, but no earlier than 6 months from the time the measures are introduced, decide, having ensured that any unresolved material objections received are considered, whether to make all or any of the measures permanent.

## 2.0 RELEVANT PREVIOUS DECISIONS

- 2.1 The decision of the Delegated Powers Report No. 1867 Montagu Road area parking and traffic investigations proposing to introduce various improvement measures in the area, was to progress the proposals through the relevant statutory consultation procedures.
- 2.2 The issue of the proposed Montagu Road area parking and traffic improvement measures was discussed at the Hendon Residents Forum on 16<sup>th</sup> January 2012 and referred to the Hendon Area Environment Sub-Committee on 16<sup>th</sup> January 2013. The decision of the Hendon Area Environment Sub-Committee was for Officers to produce a report to the next meeting of the Sub-Committee on 13 March 2013 regarding the outcome of the statutory consultation carried out in West Hendon WH3 Controlled Parking Zone, for their determination.

## 3.0 CORPORATE PRIORITIES AND POLICY CONSIDERATIONS

3.1 Improving parking and traffic conditions in the vicinity of the local residents and the school in Montagu Road and effectively managing the traffic movement throughout the local road network will contribute to the Corporate Plan priority "A Successful London Suburb" and contribute to strategic objectives of "keeping Barnet moving through the efficient management of the roads and pavements network" by improving quality of life for residents through affording them better parking protection, improving safety for the school by improving the traffic and parking conditions and help to keep traffic moving by improving safety at junctions and other lengths of road, and contributing to "The Sustainable Community Strategy for Barnet 2010-2020".

3.2 Council priorities as set out in the Corporate Plan is to ensure every school is a good school, promoting strong, safe communities for everyone and investing in children, and amending parking layout and working with the school and local residents to promote improved local habits supports these objectives.

## 4.0 RISK MANAGEMENT ISSUES

- 4.1 I do not consider the issues involved are likely to give rise to policy considerations as the waiting restrictions would improve safety and traffic flow, and the provision of school 'drop off' areas and amendments to parking bays would help improve the parking provision for residents and parents/carers of children attending the school, and improve the traffic flow by helping to disperse local traffic by absorbing it into the wider network of local roads.
- 4.2 I consider the issues involved may lead to some level of public concern from motorists who may well be used to parking on the yellow lines when they are not in operation. However, the 'at any time' waiting restrictions have been proposed in locations where it is considered that safety is an issue and in order to deter obstructive parking, improve traffic flow, sightlines and safety parking should not take place.
- 4.3 I consider the issues involved may also lead to some level of public concern from local residents and visitors who feel they are losing too many resident permit holder parking spaces or longer stay visitor parking places. However, it is considered that there would still be enough spaces within the area to accommodate local needs, and that the revision of the parking layout would lead to increased safety which would result from more appropriate traffic management.

## 5.0 EQUALITIES AND DIVERSITY ISSUES

- 5.1 The improved safety elements and traffic movements will benefit all road users equally as they will improve safety and traffic flow at those locations. It may disadvantage motorists, such as blue badge holders, who are customarily used to parking in these locations. However, the experimental scheme allows for any necessary changes to be made should it be deemed necessary.
- 5.2 The introduction of dedicated school pick up and drop off points will benefit both residents and visitors to the school by better managing the traffic through the area at the busy school and Madrassa pick up and drop off times, thereby improving the safety of the area.
- 5.3 The extension of the operational hours of the Controlled Parking Zone (CPZ) in certain roads will benefit local residents as will increased parking protection.
- 5.4 Impact on other user groups may only become apparent once the operation has been experienced. However, further consideration can be given to particular users and readily reacted to through the experimental nature of the scheme.
- 6.0 USE OF RESOURCES IMPLICATIONS (Finance, Procurement, Performance & Value for Money, Staffing, IT, Property, Sustainability)
- 6.1 The proposed parking changes require amendments to Traffic Management Orders. Estimated costs for the necessary statutory process, including advertising, printing and all officer time, including consideration of any comments received and report writing are

- estimated to be £11,000 the costs of which can be met from existing Environment, Planning and Regeneration Capital budgets
- 6.2 The estimated cost for implementation of the measures including signing and lining and officer time is approximately £16,000.
- 6.3 The lines and signs require periodic ongoing routine maintenance.

#### 7.0 LEGAL ISSUES

- 7.1 The Traffic Management Act 2004 places an obligation on authorities to ensure the expeditious movement of traffic on their road network. Authorities are required to make arrangements as they consider appropriate for planning and carrying out the action to be taken in performing the duty.
- 7.2 The Council as Highway Authority has the necessary legal powers to introduce or amend Traffic Management Orders through the Road Traffic Regulation Act 1984.

#### 8. CONSTITUTIONAL POWERS

8.1 Constitution Part 3 – Responsibility for Functions – Area Environment Sub-committees perform functions that are the responsibility of the Executive including highways use and regulation not the responsibility of the Council, within the boundaries of their areas in accordance with Council policy and within budget.

#### 9.0 BACKGROUND INFORMATION

- 9.1 Following investigations in relation to concerns highlighted regarding ongoing issues being suffered in the Montagu Road area in relation to traffic and parking in the vicinity of the educational establishment in Montagu Road, the recommendation of the previous Delegated Powers Report (no. 1867) was to progress to statutory consultation proposals to introduce traffic and parking improvement measures in the Montagu Road area.
- 9.2 The Statutory Consultation commenced on 29<sup>th</sup> November 2012 and gave members of the public three weeks to comment on or object to the proposals. As part of the statutory consultation, notices detailing the proposals were published in the local press newspaper and the London Gazette, and similar notices were displayed on street throughout the area. Letters were also hand delivered to all properties within the effected area, Algernon Road, Montagu Road, Dartmouth Road, Bertram Road and Audley Road. The proposals are illustrated in Appendix A.
- 9.3 The Council received a total of 95 items of correspondence from members of the public containing comments and objections relating to the proposals. 85 items were received from local residents, 8 were from people who represent local organisations who use the local amenities, and 2 from parents of children who attend Ayesha Community Education School in Montagu Road.
- 9.4 The main cause of concern and therefore the proposal most objected to, is the proposed extension of the operational hours of the Controlled Parking Zone (CPZ). Of the 85 written objections received from residents, 41 were from residents living outside the area proposed for the extension, concerned that if the hours are extended in the adjacent roads, it would lead to displaced parking and therefore increase parking problems in the roads within the 1 hour section of the CPZ. 42 of the objections were received from

residents within the proposed extension area, who are extremely troubled by the proposals and feel that the long hours would have a negative impact on their quality of life and unfairly increase their financial burdens as would need to purchase resident permits and additional visitor vouchers for evening and weekend parking which is unaffordable and would alienate family and friends.

- 9.5 4 petitions were also received, containing a total of 765 signatures objecting to various aspects of the proposal:
  - (i) a petition containing 39 signatures of residents objecting to the proposed extension of the CPZ hours.
  - (ii) a petition from the parents of children who attend the West Hendon Pre-School in St Johns Church on the corner of Algernon Road and Vicarage Road with 29 signatures objecting to the loss of parking bays in Algernon Road and Vicarage Road.
  - (iii) a 254 signature petition objecting to all proposals and requesting congestion management by changing the traffic priorities in Montagu Road and Algernon Road, containing the signatures of people from various community organisations who use or attend St Johns Church and Barnet Multicultural Centre.
  - (iv) a petition containing 443 signatures from users of the school in Montagu Road who object to the proposed extension of the CPZ operational hours and request the hours are reduced to 10am to 11am Monday to Friday. The petition also requests a 30 minute maximum stay in the proposed 15 min max stay 'free' bays and for more of these bays to be provided as the proposed maximum stay and the quantity of spaces provided is insufficient.
- 9.6 The petition containing 39 signatures was received from residents of the Audley Road end of Montagu Road, and the section of Bertram Road between Montague Road and Vicarage Road, within the proposed extension area, who object to increased CPZ operational hours.
- 9.7 The significantly high number of overall resident objections to the extension of the operational hours of the CPZ came from properties in the northern section on Bertram Road (between Vicarage Road and Montagu Road), which in comparison to the number of properties is in the 41 percentile, and also in the section of Montagu Road between Dartmouth Road and Audley Road, which in comparison to the number of properties equates to approximately 28% of residents against, in contrast to the number of residents objecting in the opposite end of Montagu Road, which equates to approximately 8% and from the northern section of Dartmouth Road, between Vicarage Road and Montagu Road, where approximately 7% of residential properties object to the extension.
- 9.8 People commented that the problems are only for a short time during pick up and drop off periods, and that the other times the roads are generally quiet, which is the general nature and consequence of living near a school. They feel the proposals unfairly penalise the area and its residents. Whilst some reaffirmed beliefs of parking problems occurring in the area, it was also commented that it is thought that parking is not the main issue, if even an issue at all.
- 9.9 The results indicate that residents of properties who live further away and are not in close proximity to the school, feel they do not have a problem and that although it is appreciated that problems are occurring nearer to the school, feel the proposal is too extreme for the nature of the area therefore do not want extended hours. Many of these respondents seem to be content with the parking situation as it is now or would prefer the hours of operation of the CPZ to revert back to 1 hour a day to co-inside with other nearby roads.

- 9.10 Officers consider that if the operational hours of only the area immediately outside the school was to be extended, the adjoining roads would be adversely affected. However, the concerns and wishes of some residents stating they may be currently unaffected as they are slightly further away from the school are recognised and appreciated.
- 9.11 Of those who commented on the traffic congestion aspect of the proposals, there seems to be a general consensus that traffic congestion around the Algernon Road, Montagu Road, Station Road junctions is a long standing problem that does need to be addressed. Some commented that they would prefer a change to the traffic priorities in Algernon Road rather than a change to the parking layout in the area. However, like those comments received at the public drop in, concerns for the proposed traffic congestion improvements for the location were raised, and it was suggested that a change in the traffic priority, either by making Algernon Road one-way, or by making adjustments to the Algernon Road/Station Road junction, would be a more preferred option. However, prior to the statutory consultation, as detailed in the previous delegated powers report, the council carried out extensive investigations in order to establish the most viable option for the area and based on the results considered that the negatives of making such changes would outweigh the benefits, as changes to traffic priorities would be of detriment to the surrounding area which would not cope with the resulting increased conflicts. As such it is considered that amendment to the parking layout would be most beneficial for the area.
- 9.12 The petition received containing 443 signatures from users of the Montagu Road School, objects in the main to the proposal to extend the operational hours of the CPZ. They feel that the issues occurring in the area are no different to those that occur around any other school and therefore believe the proposal to be unfair and discriminatory. The petition therefore requests that the CPZ operational hours are changed to 10am to 11am Monday to Friday to match the other roads in the local vicinity. The petition also advises that all the other proposals are supported but that the number of spaces allocated for pick up and drop off is insufficient and request the 15 min maximum stay of the 'free' bays be extended to 30 minutes as they consider 15 minutes is not a long enough time period for the purpose.
- 9.13 It has been suggested that the only time parking becomes a problem for local roads, is in the evenings and at weekends when parking is in high demand as the majority of residents are at home and utilise all possible kerb space. Therefore, if the CPZ operational hours were to be extended to these times, there would not be enough space for permit holders to park and as such parking problems would increase.
- 9.14 The proposals to extend the operational hours and remove a certain aspect of longer stay visitor parking facilities will be detrimental to the local community. The local amenities such as St Johns Church and Church Hall and in particular The Barnet Multicultural Community Centre rely on the revenue that is generated from renting the halls for private functions and by the organisations who use the centre, for the upkeep, maintenance and running of the buildings. There are concerns that it would result in the centres loosing their appeal due to strict parking controls and the added costs that would be involved, and that Organisations that currently use the local facilities would find other premises which would result in a loss of income for the premises and the decline of local services. It is also felt that the proposed 'drop off' parking bays would be of detriment to parents whose children attend the nursery in Algernon Road and users of the Multicultural Centre who need to park for longer than 15 minutes in those areas.

# **Summaries**

- 9.15 Based on the responses received and the conflicting concerns it is considered that a smaller area should have the operational hours extended, that being the roads closest to the main area of concern, Dartmouth Road, between Vicarage Road and Montagu Road, Montagu Road, between Dartmouth Road and Algernon Road, and Algernon Road. This may also help to reduce levels of any displaced parking that may occur in the 1 hour CPZ sections in the vicinity. However, we will monitor the remaining roads subsequent to changes being implemented.
- 9.16 It is acknowledged that the main cause of concern for the area is the traffic congestion and the effect this has on safety. The idea of the proposals combined is to try to reduce the number of vehicles that travel through Montagu Road in order to alleviate traffic congestion in the area around the junctions of Station Road, Algernon Road, Montagu Road, and it is considered that by making it easier for people to pick up and drop of their children further away and by eliminating potential parking directly outside the school, this aim could be achieved by dissuading the use of Montagu Road. It is recognised that some level of school traffic will still need to or choose to travel through Montagu Road, and as such in order to allow for a certain amount of this to take place and minimise obstruction to through traffic, the provision of a length of yellow line waiting restriction would enable this as this provides vehicles with a place to pull in out of the way of through traffic.
- 9.17 In relation to providing more drop off spaces, it is considered that realistically there are no other viable locations in the area, as any additional conversion would mean too much of a loss of vital resident parking spaces and would put too much of a strain on resident parking. It is noted that there are some parking bays in Vicarage Road which do not front residential properties; however, they may be used as overspill, although any additional spaces are considered too far from the school to be attractive for use as pick up and drop off places. Whilst it is acknowledged that the school believe the number of drop off and pick up spaces to be insufficient (they feel they need at least 60 spaces), the aim is not to provide a parking space for each parent but to encourage a steady turn over vehicles and to help alleviate the pressures on Montagu Road. It is not the council's responsibility to provide parking for parents however, it is considered that these pick up and drop off locations will still go some way to alleviating parking and congestion problems in Montagu Road, thereby improving safety.
- 9.18 Regarding the request for the CPZ operational hours to return to 1 hour a day, it is considered that the already established need for an all day CPZ still has merit in these roads due to the conflicting demands in the area. Therefore, it is not considered that this would be a viable option at this time.
- 9.19 The council recognises the schools' concerns regarding the 15 minute maximum stay time being too short to allow sufficient use as pick up and drop off points as they are positioned a distance away from the school. However, do not believe that 30 minutes would be viable as it is considered that if the maximum stay period is too long and would defeat the intended purpose of the bays which is to allow a quick turn over of vehicles picking up and dropping off children, rather than providing a place to park up and wait for longer periods. However, in light of the schools concerns, it is considered that the maximum stay of these bays could be extended to 20 minutes.
- 9.20 A lot of concern was also raised from members of the community who use, attend or are members off organisations who use the Multicultural Community Centre and St Johns Church in Algernon Road. The main concerns relate to the proposed limited stay 'free' parking bays reducing the number of places for longer stay visitor parking, which it is felt

- will be detrimental for users of the multicultural centre and the church as the longer operational hours will make it difficult for people to park.
- 9.21 Investigations have shown that the two existing dual use bays which are proposed to be converted to maximum stay free bays in Algernon Road, opposite the church, are on average under used during the day when the CPZ operates.
- 9.22 By extending the CPZ hours of operation people believe it will effect the community buildings as they are customarily used to free parking in the evenings and on the weekends, which supported by the under usage during the day, both suggest that the current operational hours are more suitable for the needs of these facilities and that the main periods for visitor usage may be evening and weekends. In addition to this, residents at the Algernon Road end of Vicarage Road object to the loss of resident parking provision. However, there are only 3 properties situated on Vicarage Road, the majority of which have off street parking facilities, and resident permit bays in close proximity. Therefore, it is considered that the road can accommodate a loss of resident permit holder provision in this location.
- 9.23 The results of the consultation show there is a conflict between the needs of the school and the needs of the other local amenities. Although, the main aim is to improve the parking and traffic problems being suffered in and around the vicinity of the school, the council want to support its local communities so it is also mindful of adversely affecting other amenities that service the area and need support.
- 9.24 Therefore, it is considered that the operation of the proposed limited stay bays and the existing pay by phone bays in Algernon Road and Vicarage Road should be amended to complement the needs of the conflicting demands highlighted in the area, but without compromising the initial aims of reducing traffic and parking congestion at peak times. A reduction of the proposed operational hours of these bays in the evening from 9pm to 7pm would reduce some of the pressures in parking for visitors to the local amenities and residents of Algernon Road and Vicarage Road, and as the bays are not in close proximity to the school, would not be detrimental to the principle of the proposals.
- 9.25 It has since been confirmed that the situation relating to the parking congestion in Montagu Road has now eased later in the evening as the school have reopened the car park for the classes operating from the school after 7pm and as such the need for a later restriction is no longer there. In light if this and the comments received through the statutory consultation process, it is considered that the evening operational hours can be reduced to 7pm from the proposed 9pm finish, as generally the majority of residents would customarily have arrived home before this time. The earlier finish time during the week would allow more flexibility for residents in the evening, and reduce the possible financial implications for residents of the area and visitors to the local amenities in Algernon Road.
- 9.26 It is still considered that there is merit in the nature of the measures proposed for the area to improve the parking and traffic congestion, however, following considerations of comments and objections received, the council is confident that the revised proposals outlined in this report would not detract from what the council originally aimed to achieve in the area. However, the council recognises the feelings of the community and the complexity of the situation in the area, and as such, in light of the high levels of conflicting concerns it is considered that it would be prudent to introduce the revised proposals (as detailed in drawing number 14817\_81b) on an experimental basis in order to ascertain how well the improvement measures operate for the community and enable the council to make any necessary amendments before making any permanent changes.

9.27 Details of the proposals consulted on and the subsequently revised proposals are illustrated on Drawing Nos. 14817\_81a and 14817\_81b respectively, attached to this report.

# **Ward Members**

9.28 In addition to the views sort from the West Hendon Ward Councillors prior to the statutory consultation, as detailed in the previous Delegated Powers Report number 1867, Officers met with West Hendon Councillor Slocombe and Councillor Sodha to discuss the nature of the concerns raised during the consultation and the subsequent revised proposals in order to ascertain their views. Councillor Johnson was not in attendance but advised she was happy for her fellow Ward Councillors to represent the views of the West Hendon Ward Councillors. The Councillors relayed their concerns regarding the nature of the conflicting demands and issues highlighted during the consultation and advised of their recognition and support of the resulting revised proposals.

## Recommendation

9.29 Accordingly having given due consideration to all written comments and objections received, the elements variously discussed at the Hendon Forum and Area Environment Sub-Committee dialogue with local community representatives and ward members it is recommended that the revised measures as illustrated on the attached Drawing Nos. 14817\_81a and 14817\_81b and detailed on Appendix C to this report are introduced on an experimental basis with consideration to be given in due course as to whether further changes in the area might be considered and also whether any changes introduced are subsequently made permanent or not.

#### 10. LIST OF BACKGROUND PAPERS

- 10.1 Delegated Powers Report No. 1867 Montagu Road area parking and traffic investigations
- 10.2 Copies of correspondence received resulting from public advertisement of the proposals and analysis spreadsheets.

Legal – JO'H CFO – MC